



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

by the revisers at Jefferson's "importunities, and no sheriff has ever since been compelled to pry out an eye or bite off a nose." At one place (p. 83) the author would have us believe that Jefferson inserted in the Declaration of Independence a clause favoring freedom to the slaves, which at another place (p. 135) becomes "a paragraph denouncing slavery," the reference in each case being, of course, to the paragraph in opposition to the slave trade. So in explanation of the Jefferson letter to Mazzei, written in 1796, it is stated that Mazzei was at that time "in Europe attempting to negotiate a loan for the United States with a petty prince of Hungary." Such are a few of many examples of the author's ignorance of general history; and as a result the whole book is written on the slap-dash, hearsay order, save where the scissors and the glue pot made writing unnecessary.

At the same time, it would be unfair to Mr. Curtis, full as his book is of ignorance and error, not to acknowledge that he has made an interesting volume, and one that can be read with very distinct pleasure. There can be no question that the author has industriously and honestly toiled, and he has brought together a great mass of material out of which a most delightful volume might have been written, and this but makes the regret the keener that Mr. Curtis had not the mental equipment and education to use it properly.

PAUL LEICESTER FORD.

Writings of James Madison, comprising his Public Papers and his Private Correspondence, including numerous Letters and Documents now for the first time printed. Edited by GAILLARD HUNT. Vol. I., 1769-1783; Vol. II., 1783-1787. (New York and London: G. P. Putnam's Sons. 1900, 1901. Pp. xl, 484; xvii, 412.)

In 1837 the Federal government bought of Mrs. Madison a set of manuscripts, in duplicate, comprising "the Debates of the Convention which framed the Constitution of the United States, prepared by Mr. Madison, together with the Debates taken by him in the Congress of the Confederation in 1782, 1783, and 1787, and selections made by him, and prepared under his eye, from his letters, narrating the proceedings of that body during the periods of his service in it." These were printed in 1840 as the *Papers of James Madison*, edited by Henry D. Gilpin. In 1848 the government purchased from Mrs. Madison most of the remaining manuscripts of her husband. Four volumes, made up chiefly from the additional manuscripts thus purchased, were printed in 1865 under the title *Letters and other Writings of James Madison*. The two printed collections supplement each other, and students interested in Madison's career have always been obliged, with considerable inconvenience, to turn perpetually from one to the other. Accordingly, we must all be deeply grateful to Mr. Hunt for undertaking the publication of a series in which Madison's letters and writings are combined in a single chronological order. The volumes are handsomely made, in style uni-

form with the similar collections of "Writings of the Fathers" brought out by the same firm of publishers.

The two volumes now published comprise somewhat more than two hundred and fifty letters (or parts of letters), seventeen documents, and the record of debates in the Congress of the Confederation from November 4, 1782, to June 21, 1783. For the period last mentioned, the debates are made the main text, while the letters or parts of letters that illustrate or supplement them are placed in foot-notes below. This is on the whole the rational arrangement, the continuous record being the important thing. Presumably the same course will be followed in the case of Madison's invaluable notes of the debates in the Convention of 1787, which we understand will fill Volumes III. and IV. What will be done with the debates in Congress from February 19 to April 25, 1787, does not appear; they are not printed in the second volume before us, though it extends to the latter date.

The present volumes contain exceedingly little that is new. That it should be so is almost inevitable. The title, it will be observed, mentions "numerous letters and documents now for the first time printed"; and the preface alludes to "sources widely scattered and embracing various public, private and official depositories." But these phrases wait their justification in later volumes. Of 262 letters printed in these two volumes, 126 have already appeared in Gilpin, 106 in the *Letters and other Writings*, one in Bancroft's *Constitution*, and perhaps one or two others elsewhere. The new letters are nearly all quite insignificant notes to Pendleton or Randolph, or to Madison's father and brother, not more important than the forty letters which, on the other hand, are printed in Gilpin or the *Writings* but are omitted from the present series. Two letters to Henry Lee (II. 284, 286) are exceptions, well worth printing as indicative of character; so is another, to Jefferson (II. 246), relating chiefly to points of natural history. As to source, only two letters seem to have been found outside the walls of the Department of State, of which the editor is an official. The texts of about three-fifths are derived from the Madison MSS., of a few from the Washington MSS., of a few more from the printed *Writings*, and of about eighty from Gilpin.

As to this last point, Mr. Hunt, who is evidently scrupulous as to textual exactness, shows himself abundantly aware that texts should be derived from the original manuscript, and not from anyone's print; but he has been hampered by circumstances so extraordinary as to be quite worth mentioning. It may not be generally known, though it is quite in the line of the government's usual experience in buying manuscripts, that, in spite of the act of Congress mentioned in the first sentence above and of Mrs. Madison's conveyance, none of the letters printed by Gilpin, excepting the block from November 5, 1782, to the end of 1783, are possessed by the State Department either in original or in duplicate. Moreover, the actual originals of nearly all these missing letters were offered at auction, in the face of a long-suffering government, in the Mc-

Guire sale of 1892. They were bought by a certain historical society, which, it may be understood, has refused Mr. Hunt permission to collate his texts with the originals. Mr. Hunt alludes to none of these facts. But anyone who has compared the State Department's *Calendar of the Correspondence of James Madison* with Gilpin, with the catalogue of the McGuire sale, and with this society's report of 1894, will understand his mild and colorless remark (p. xxxv) that "The originals of a few [*sic*] of the letters printed in *The Madison Papers* have been withheld from the editor, and he has been obliged to reproduce them as they were printed, in the first volume of" [that] "edition, indicating their source as he has that of every other paper appearing in these volumes." About eighty are, as we have intimated, so designated.

Among the documents printed (meaning documents other than letters) are several new pieces, of great interest, chiefly fruits of Madison's active service as a member of Congress. It is gratifying to see (II. 391) that the large portions of his introduction to the debates of 1787 which were lost when the Department of State published its edition a few years ago, have since been recovered. The whole is now given. It is not easy to see why the Declaration of Rights and Constitution of Virginia have been included (I. 35-49); only six words of the former have ever been traced to Madison, and not one of the latter.

Mr. Hunt's texts appear to be good. "Moran Treaty at Fort Stanwix" (II. 76) should no doubt be "Indian Treaty"; "Carter Bratton" (II. 194) should be "Carter Braxton"; and the place of publication of Ubbo Emmius (II. 265) might easily have been corrected from "Sugd. Batavorum" to "Lugd. Batavorum." There is some want of scholarship in the foot-notes to Madison's Notes on Ancient and Modern Confederacies (II. 369-390). But in spite of a few small blemishes, Mr. Hunt has given us a good edition, with good notes, which on many grounds besides convenience is entitled to supplant its two mutually complementary predecessors. The first volume contains as a frontispiece a very interesting portrait, copied from the life-sized marble medallion bust by Ceracchi (1792) now owned by the Department of State.

The main contents of the volumes having been so long before the public, it has seemed to the reviewer inappropriate to dwell upon their character as materials for the biography of Madison or for the history of the United States. But he cannot forbear mentioning a curious little discovery he made while mousing among the letters of Vol. I.: namely, that of all the letters written by Madison while attending Congress in Philadelphia, 137 in all, there are only 26 that were not written on Tuesday. The trait is so characteristic as to be amusing. The methodical little man arranged with himself never to miss a Virginia mail.

J. FRANKLIN JAMESON.